

**From:** Sumitomo, Robert M.  
**To:** Yoshioka, Wayne; Hamayasu, Toru  
**CC:** Stoeck, Lynette; Chang, Deanna  
**Sent:** 11/27/2009 9:35:44 AM  
**Subject:** FW: Friends of Makakilo -- Request your approval

# Redacted

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Sokugawa, Kathy K.  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 25, 2009 3:59 PM  
**To:** Tanoue, David K.; Sumitomo, Robert M.  
**Subject:** FW: Friends of Makakilo -- Request your approval

## Redacted

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Robert Q Bruhl [mailto:RBruhl@drhorton.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 25, 2009 3:23 PM  
**To:** Stanfield, Bob; Sokugawa, Kathy K.  
**Subject:** Fw: Friends of Makakilo -- Request your approval

Bob Bruhl  
w808.528.9071  
c808.372.3073

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Mike T Jones [mailto:MTJones@drhorton.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 25, 2009 06:22 PM Central Standard Time  
**To:** Robert Q Bruhl  
**Cc:** 'lee tokuhara'  
**Subject:** Fw: Friends of Makakilo -- Request your approval

Sent with Good (www.good.com)

-----Original Message-----

**From:** haipoalani@yahoo.com [mailto:haipoalani@yahoo.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 25, 2009 06:09 PM Central Standard Time  
**To:** Mike T Jones  
**Subject:** Fw: Friends of Makakilo -- Request your approval

FYI

AR00121102

Sent via BlackBerry by AT&T

---

From: "Dr. Kioni Dudley" <drkionidudley@hawaii.rr.com>  
Date: Wed, 25 Nov 2009 14:06:54 -1000  
To: 'Dr. Kioni Dudley' <drkionidudley@hawaii.rr.com>  
Subject: Friends of Makakilo -- Request your approval

Aloha, Friends of Makakilo,

During these months while Horton regroups, we need to do everything we can to prevent them from coming back. Our on-going movement to collect petition signatures and to build community support, and our efforts to get the city to change the urban growth boundary to exclude Ho'opili are two ways we are doing this. This letter represents a third. The Ho'opili rail stop is a centerpiece in the Ho'opili plan. High-density development surrounding the station is very lucrative. If we could get the rail moved completely away from the property, the project would lose much of its attractiveness, and our chances of ultimate success would be much greater.

You possibly read yesterday that the Governor intends to thoroughly review the FEIS for the rail. This letter informs her about many of the unspoken problems which the rail, as currently planned, brings for our people. I think you will find it eye-opening, possibly shocking, yourself. If you don't have time to read it now, print it and save it for later.

Before making any major new move in the name of the Friends of Makakilo, I consult the membership for their approval. This letter moves us into the discussion of rail, a new area. I see it as an essential effort, tied directly to our purpose, and directly affecting us, but it does broaden our concerns.

If you have objection to this, please write me at your earliest convenience. Should I not hear objection from a significant number of members before 9 a.m. on Friday, November 27, I will send the letter to the governor.

Thank you.

Kioni Dudley

The Friends of Makakilo

92-1365 Hauone Street Makakilo Hawai'i 96707

Telephone and Fax: (808) 672-8888

November 27, 2009

Governor Linda Lingle

AR00121103

State Capitol

Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

Aloha, Governor Lingle,

Re: Unaddressed Leeward problems with rail

As you prepare to look at the Final Environmental Impact Statement for the rail, we would like to bring to your attention a number of major problems in the Leeward area that have come to light and possibly have not yet been dealt with in it.

1. Ho'opili station in the middle of an open farm field.

The petition of DR Horton to change the designation of 1555 acres of farmland to urban was declared to be deficient by the Land Use Commission in August, 2009. Conditions set by the State Department of Agriculture and the State Department of Transportation are truly insurmountable, and Horton is unlikely to return unless a more favorable state administration is elected. With overwhelming Leeward resident support, efforts are moving forward to keep the land permanently in agriculture. If these efforts are successful, the Ho'opili station, as planned, will be constructed in the middle of an empty farm field.

2. Route of train should be moved entirely out of the farm fields.

With the promise of Ho'opili ever arising being so slim, the route of the rail should be moved from the middle of the fields to run alongside Farrington Hwy. There is no reason for it to run through the best quality and highest producing farmland in the state, where it will always invite development and may negatively affect the land.

3. Rail may be an inappropriate use of land in an agricultural district.

"HRS 205-4.5 Permissible uses within the agricultural districts" limits permissible uses of lands for which the land bureau's detailed land classification overall productivity rating is A or B. The Horton lands are all A and B. Only uses specifically mentioned in article 205-4.5 are acceptable. While subsection (7) mentions roadways and utility lines, but it does not mention railways.

4. No park-and-ride for thousands of commuters on Ft. Weaver Rd.

Ft. Weaver Rd. is the major commuter corridor to the freeway for residents in 'Ewa and 'Ewa Beach. Any hope of luring these drivers from their cars to the train depends on their passing an easily accessible park-and-ride before they reach the freeway. The West-Loch station, on Farrington Hwy. just inside Waipahu, which should serve this purpose, has zero park-and-ride stalls. It thus prevents ridership, rather than encourages it, contradicting the whole purpose of the rail.

5. Rail being built to benefit developers, not to solve current traffic problems.

• The first stop for the rail is the DeBartelo Center. This center does not yet exist, nor does the intensive development expected around the station. The site for this station is now

in the middle of open fields. Beneficiaries: DHHL and DeBarelo developers.

- The second stop is UH West O'ahu. UHWO does not exist yet, nor does the intensive development expected around it. The site for this station is now in the middle of open fields. Beneficiaries: State and DR Horton. It is intended to serve H-1 commuters, but its park-and-ride for H-1 commuters seems inadequate.

- The third stop is Ho'opili which, if ever approved, would be the largest development ever considered by the Land Use Commission. Sole beneficiary - DRHorton, a Delaware company with headquarters in Texas.

- The fourth stop is the West Loch station in Waipahu which should draw commuters from Ft. Weaver Rd., as well as from Village Park and Royal Kunia, but has zero park-and-ride stalls. Beneficiary: Robinson estate.

6. Rail being built for malihini, not current struggling West-side commuters.

At the Western end, the rail is being built for new people who don't yet live there, to solve problems that their arrival will cause. It is not being built for the people who voted for it, and who fully expect it to help solve their traffic problems. The rail has been misrepresented as the solution to the problems our people endure.

7. Have the people of Waipahu been consulted about the loss of their newly beautified main thoroughfare?

For decades, Waipahu was the ugly step-sister community on the island. The recent Farrington Hwy. beautification project, still reaching full grow-out, has transformed it into an attractive little town. The elevated rail will replace this beauty with ugly pillars inviting graffiti. Have the people of this town been adequately informed and consulted about their impending loss?

8. UHWO park-and-ride needs parking structure to save priceless farmland.

One thousand park-and-ride stalls are currently planned at the UHWO station. These will spread across two five-acre lots. However, the soil on this acreage is top grade "A" soil as designated by the Land Study Bureau soil survey of 1971. Rather than sprawling lots, parking structures should be built to conserve space, and the surrounding land should be kept for agriculture as long as possible. Commuters need quick access to parking; thus, multi-level structures should have exterior ramps to every level

9. One thousand UHWO park-and-ride stalls may be inadequate.

By 2030, H-1 traffic between North-South Rd. and Waipahu is anticipated to deteriorate to Levels of Service E and F. As people see the train whizzing by, parallel to the freeway, while they sit in stalled traffic anticipating another one and half hour commute to the city, thousands might be expected to leave their cars if easily accessible parking stalls were provided nearby.

10. Train could be at-grade from DeBartelo Center to Stadium if ORL right of way was used.

There are also, however, many advantages to using the old ORL right-of-way

- Most, if not all, of the old ORL right-of-way from Nanakuli to the stadium still remains open. If necessary, pipelines beneath it could be moved to one side. Using it would shift the construction from busy main arteries to unpopulated areas, and could save drivers from years of frustrating inconvenience as it building it tore up streets and backed up traffic on Farrington Hwy. and Kamehameha Hwy. from the West end of Waipahu to the stadium. Running close to the ocean and lochs, the right-of-way crosses very few roads, and could possibly well

accommodate at-grade rail for the entire distance. Rising seas over the next decades could impact the low lying, water-side terrain it crosses, but planning for the future, with dikes and measures to raise the height of land along the seashore in preparation for the sea-rise should be expected as integral parts of future-planning in the FEIS.

- If the old ORL right-of-way became the primary rail route, a park-and-ride could be constructed where it crosses Ft. Weaver Rd., allowing the people of 'Ewa and 'Ewa Beach the access to the rail that they deserve.
- If the old ORL right-of-way formed the primary rail route, the extension West of the DeBartelo Center—through Kapolei and onto Nanakuli—would be uncluttered and easy to construct.
- If the old ORL right-of-way became the primary rail route, the problem of the rail passing through the Ho'opili farmland would be solved. Initially the train could start at UHWO, heading toward the De Bartelo Center, then follow the ORL line into the city. In future years, when the mainline would be extended West, through Kapolei and beyond, the UHWO segment could become a spur.

11. Have the effects of rising seas caused by climate change been considered in the planning of the entire route for the rail in the FEIS?

It is likely that the FEIS does not take rising seas caused by climate change into consideration. Certainly, rising seas will cause tremendous impacts re-shaping communities through which it passes. Should the current FEIS not consider and plan for these problems, this grave deficiency needs to be corrected. A four and a half billion dollar project should not proceed without complete awareness of the reconfiguration of the island that must be anticipated over the next century.

It must be noted that a percentage of our members do not support the rail, as presented to us at this time, for various reasons—expense, anticipation of low-ridership, preference for other viable alternatives, loss of view-planes in the city, and so forth. However, almost all of us agree that there must be some solution to our insufferable traffic problems. While we commend the mayor for having the courage to push through some rapid-transit system, we believe that the problems mentioned above must be dealt with before construction of any system begins.

Finally, above and beyond these points having to do with problems in West Oahu, the Friends of Makakilo wishes to express our great concern about the visual impact of the elevated train in the city. After having seen so many cities tear down elevated structures that for decades destroyed the character, beauty, and local sense of place, why are we, who live in Paradise, constructing a gross elevated structure that will destroy view-planes down every street in the city and lose for us what we consider most precious? This makes no sense when there are possible alternatives. At-grade light rail may be slowed somewhat by traffic, but it has been shown that time lost is fully compensated by the rail running through the center of the city, cutting time walking or riding from the rail to workplace. The West side desperately needs relief from its ever-growing traffic morass, but we also desperately need to get the right kind of project, on the best path to the city, which won't destroy Paradise in the process.

Dr. Kioni Dudley

President, Friends of Makakilo